



ADVANCED
General Certificate of Education
2023

Religious Studies
Assessment Unit A2 5
assessing

Themes in the Celtic Church, Reformation
and Post-Reformation Church

[ARE51]

MONDAY 19 JUNE, AFTERNOON

MARK
SCHEME

General Marking Instructions

Introduction

The main purpose of a mark scheme is to ensure that examinations are marked accurately, consistently and fairly. The mark scheme provides examiners with an indication of the nature and range of candidates' responses likely to be worthy of credit. It also sets out the criteria which they should apply in allocating marks to candidates' responses.

Assessment objectives

Below are the assessment objectives for **GCE Religious Studies**

Candidates should be able to:

- demonstrate knowledge and understanding of religion, including:
 - religious, philosophical and/or ethical thought and teaching;
 - influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies;
 - cause and significance of similarities and differences in belief, teaching and practice; and
 - approaches to the study of religion and belief (AO1); and
- analyse and evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief, including their significance, influence and study (AO2).

Quality of candidates' responses

In marking the examination papers, examiners should be looking for a quality of response reflecting the level of maturity which may reasonably be expected of a 17 or 18-year-old which is the age at which the majority of candidates sit their GCE examinations.

Flexibility in marking

Mark schemes are not intended to be totally prescriptive. No mark scheme can cover all the responses which candidates may produce. In the event of unanticipated answers, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement to assess the validity of answers. If an answer is particularly problematic, then examiners should seek the guidance of the Supervising Examiner.

Positive marking

Examiners are encouraged to be positive in their marking, giving appropriate credit for what candidates know, understand and can do rather than penalising candidates for errors or omissions. Examiners should make use of the whole of the available mark range for any particular question and be prepared to award full marks for a response which is as good as might reasonably be expected of a 17 or 18-year-old GCE candidate.

Awarding zero marks

Marks should only be awarded for valid responses and no marks should be awarded for an answer which is completely incorrect or inappropriate.

Mark schemes for tasks or questions which require candidates to respond in extended written form are marked on the basis of levels of response which take account of the quality of written communication.

Levels of response

In deciding which level of response to award, examiners should look for the 'best fit' bearing in mind that weakness in one area may be compensated for by strength in another. In deciding which mark within a particular level to award to any response, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement.

The following guidance is provided to assist examiners.

- **Threshold performance:** Response which just merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the bottom of the range.
- **Intermediate performance:** Response which clearly merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the middle of the range.
- **High performance:** Response which fully satisfies the level description and should be awarded a mark at or near the top of the range.

Each of the two assessment objectives have been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

Other Aspects of Human Experience at AS Level

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, when required, to access Bands 3–5.

Synoptic Assessment at A2 Level

Candidates must support their answer with reference to at least one other unit of study to access Bands 4–5.

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

Quality of written communication

Quality of written communication is taken into account in assessing candidates' responses to all tasks and questions that require them to respond in extended written form. These tasks and questions are marked on the basis of levels of response. The description for each level of response includes reference to the quality of written communication.

For conciseness, quality of written communication is distinguished within levels of response as follows:

- Level 1: Quality of written communication is basic.
- Level 2: Quality of written communication is limited.
- Level 3: Quality of written communication is good.
- Level 4: Quality of written communication is very good.
- Level 5: Quality of written communication is excellent.

In interpreting these level descriptions, examiners should refer to the more detailed guidance provided below:

Level 1 (Basic): The candidate makes only a basic selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material lacks clarity and coherence. There is little or no use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are basic and the intended meaning is not clear.

Level 2 (Limited): The candidate makes a limited selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material may lack clarity and coherence. There is limited use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar may be such that intended meaning is not clear.

Level 3 (Good): The candidate makes a reasonable selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with some clarity and coherence. There is good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently competent to make meaning clear.

Level 4 (Very Good): The candidate makes a very good selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with clarity and coherence. There is very good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a very good standard to make meaning clear.

Level 5 (Excellent): The candidate successfully selects and uses the most appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with a high degree of clarity and coherence. There is widespread and accurate use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a sufficiently high standard to make meaning clear.

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An excellent response to the question asked. • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and knowledge. • Demonstrates a comprehensive understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A very high degree of relevant evidence, examples and scholarship. • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure. • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[17]–[20]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response to the question asked. • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge. • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A very good range of relevant evidence, examples and scholarship. • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure. • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[13]–[16]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good response to the question asked. • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge. • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A good range of relevant evidence, examples and scholarship. • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence. • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[9]–[12]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response to the question asked. • Demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding. • Demonstrates limited understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A limited range of evidence, examples and scholarship. • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence. • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[5]–[8]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response to the question asked. • Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding. • Demonstrates minimal understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • Little, if any, use of evidence, examples and scholarship. • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence. • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[1]–[4]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis. • An excellent attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • An excellent attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure. • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[25]–[30]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis. • A very good attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A very good attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure. • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[19]–[24]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis. • A good attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A good attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence. • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[13]–[18]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis. • A limited attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A limited attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence. • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[7]–[12]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis. • A basic attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A basic attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence. • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[1]–[6]

Section A

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answer **two** questions from this section

- 1 (a) Outline how the Celtic Church dealt with the Paschal Controversy prior to the Synod of Whitby.

Answers may include:

- Debate about the dating of Easter.
- Paschal Tables.
- Meeting with St Augustine; views of McNeill, Colgrave and Mynors.
- Information given by Bede.
- Letter of Laurentius of Canterbury.
- Letters of Columbanus and the Council of Chalons.
- Synod of Mag Léne and the conformity of the South of Ireland.
- The Northumbrian royal household; the views of Smyth.
- The Synod of Whitby; the views of Hughes, James.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[20]

(b) "The Synod of Whitby was more effective at reforming the Celtic Church than the Council of Trent was in reforming the Post-Reformation Church." Critically assess this claim.

Answers may include:

- The outcome of the Synod of Whitby.
- The discontinuation of the tonsure.
- Standardisation of the sacraments.
- Retaining of monastic and abbatial character; views of Hughes.
- Centralism and localism.
- Romanisation of the Church.
- Assertion of Papal authority; the views of Rees, Hardinge, Gougoud.
- Theological differences and the views of Lloyd.
- The impact of State interference in the Church; the views of McNeill.
- The influence of Celtic learning and Art.
- The impact on Iona.
- The 2nd Synod of Birr.
- The political and cultural importance of the Synod of Whitby; the views of Smyth, Hughes.
- The purpose of Trent; the views of Gilles.
- Trent's affirmation of dogma and authority; the views of Randell.
- Reconciliation with Protestants.
- Reform of clerical discipline; views of MacCulloch, Hitchcock.
- Establishment of seminaries.
- Standardisation of prayer.
- The role of the laity.
- The pace of change and lack of coherence; the views of Bokenkotter, Randell.
- The work of Erasmus.
- The Jesuits.
- Teresa of Avila.
- The reforms of Cardinal Ximenes de Cisneros.
- Possible reference to respective political and theological impacts.
- Possible acknowledgement of different contexts and circumstances.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[30]

50

AVAILABLE
MARKS

2 (a) Explain the importance of **either** Columbanus' Monastic Rules **or** his Letters.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- Provision of formal written monastic Rule.
- The Monk's Rule.
- The Community Rule.
- Ascetism of the Rules.
- The influence of the Rule of Bangor; views of Laporte, Metlake.
- Abbatial succession.
- The rule of Benedict.
- Monastic independence.
- Celtic spirituality.
- Theme of Christian Unity in the Letters (Letter to French bishops, Letter to Boniface).
- The dating of Easter and the relationship with the French bishops; views of O'Faich, Charles-Edwards.
- Relationship with the Papacy.
- Defence of the faith.
- Care of others (Letter to Young Disciple).

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[20]

(b) "Columbanus was difficult and controversial, yet he overshadowed the work of other Celtic missionaries."

How far do you agree with this statement?

Answers may include:

- Relationship with the French bishops.
- Abbatial authority and monastic independence.
- The Arian and Nestorian Controversy.
- Moral conduct of Royalty; views of Metlake, Guillemain.
- Brunhilde.
- Challenge of the Pope.
- Relationship with Gall.
- Contribution to monasticism.
- Private repeatable penance.
- Evangelisation in Burgundy.
- Promotion of Christian unity.
- Encouragement to disciples at Luxeuil.
- Importance of Speech Ethics (Sermon 11).
- Focus on being heavenly minded (Sermons).
- The contribution of Gall; the views of McNeill.
- The work of Killian.
- The Burgh Castle group.
- Missionary work of Colmcille in Pictland; the views of Finlay, Simpson.
- The impact of Iona.
- The political involvements of Colmcille, e.g. consecration of Aedan, Druim Cett.
- Aidan's work in Northumbria; views of Ryan, Colgrave and Mynors, Lightfoot.
- The significance of Lindisfarne.
- The extent to which Columbanus was difficult and controversial.
- Consideration of the extent to which Columbanus overshadowed the work of other Celtic missionaries.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[30]

50

AVAILABLE
MARKS

3 (a) Outline the methods of evangelisation used by the missionaries of the 19th century.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- Imperialism and colonialism; views of Ross, Ellis.
- Exploitation of trade routes.
- The impact of the abolition of slavery.
- The work of the London Missionary Society.
- The influence of William Carey and the Baptist Missionary Society.
- State funding of mission.
- European expansionism.
- Social change and agricultural development.
- The work of David Livingstone.
- The work of the Holy Ghost and SMA Fathers and the development of literacy.
- The contribution of women, e.g. Mercy and Loretto sisters (e.g. healthcare provision and education).
- The impact of the growth of vocation in Ireland.
- All Hallows College.
- Presbyterian mission.
- Inculturation.
- Acculturation and westernisation; the views of Clerkin, Hogan.
- The development of native clergy.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[20]

(b) Critically evaluate the view that the impact of secularisation and atheism on religion today make missionary outreach more necessary.

Answers may include:

- Issues with defining secularisation.
- Decline in church attendance.
- Decline in the influence of religion on day to day decision making.
- Separation of church and state.
- Marginalisation of religious voice politically.
- Privatisation of religion.
- Increase in spirituality as against interest in organised religion.
- Decline in belonging to religious organisations.
- Nominal belief.
- Emergence of patchwork religion or “a la cartism”.
- Growth in the culture of individualism.
- Moral relativism.
- Growth in materialism.
- Greater levels of education.
- Conservative nature of the Christian Church.
- State influence on the religious domain, e.g. same sex marriage, abortion in N.I.
- The need for church reform.
- The impact of child abuse scandals.
- The deification of science.
- The challenge of evil and suffering.
- Separation of religion from morality.
- The influence of new atheists, e.g. Harris, Dawkins, Dennett.
- Counter culturalism; views of N Bainbridge, Finke.
- Growth in religious conservatism, e.g. male and celibate priesthood.
- The challenges to mission in the developing world, e.g. Brazil, El Salvador.
- Divisions among Christian missionaries, e.g. evangelicals.
- Benefits of ecumenism – speaking as a common voice.
- Pastoral, social action-based approach to mission.
- Work of Trócaire/Cafod/Christian Aid/Tearfund.
- Contribution of Liberation Theologians.
- The need to counter ‘new atheism’, e.g. the work of Alister McGrath.
- The importance of contemporary missionary outreach both at home (e.g. healing ‘broken lives’) and abroad (e.g. protecting indigenous peoples and their social and economic rights).

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[30]

50

Section A

100

**AVAILABLE
MARKS**

Synoptic Bands

Total Marks: [20]

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An excellent attempt at analysis with a full and highly informed response to the question. • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and accurate knowledge of the themes considering the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A very high degree of relevant evidence, scholarship and exemplification with particular reference to at least one other unit of study. • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure. • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[17]–[20]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good attempt at analysis with a well informed response to the question. • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge of the themes considering the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A very good range of relevant evidence, scholarship and exemplification with particular reference to at least one other unit of study. • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure. • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[13]–[16]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good attempt at analysis with a reasonably well informed response to the question. • Demonstrates a good understanding and mainly accurate knowledge of the themes considering the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A good range of relevant evidence, scholarship and exemplification with particular reference to at least one other unit of study. • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence. • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[9]–[12]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited attempt at analysis with a limited response to the question. • Demonstrates a limited understanding and limited knowledge of the themes considering the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A limited range of relevant evidence, scholarship and exemplification with particular reference to at least one other unit of study. • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence. • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[5]–[8]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic attempt at analysis with a basic response to the question. • Demonstrates a basic understanding and basic knowledge of the themes considering the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A basic range of evidence, scholarship and exemplification with particular reference to at least one other unit of study. • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence. • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[1]–[4]

Candidates must refer to at least one other unit of study in their AO1 response to access Bands 4–5.

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis in relation to other aspects of human experience. • An excellent attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • An excellent attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure. • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[25]–[30]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis in relation to other aspects of human experience. • A very good attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A very good attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure. • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[19]–[24]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis in relation to other aspects of human experience. • A good attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A good attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence. • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[13]–[18]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis which struggles to relate to other aspects of human experience. • A limited attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A limited attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence. • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[7]–[12]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis which fails to relate to other aspects of human experience. • A basic attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A basic attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence. • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[1]–[6]

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

Section B

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Synoptic Assessment

Theme: Faith, Morality and the State

You **must** answer this question

- 4 (a) With reference to **one** historical example, clarify the moral lessons that can be learned from conflict between religion and the state. You must support your answer with reference to at least **one** other unit of study.

Answers may include:

- Particular focus on the moral lessons that can be learned.
- Reference to one historical example.
- St Paul's teaching on authority of the State.
- Teaching of Augustine.
- The Christian Church in China.
- Reference to issues such as the death penalty, workers rights, slavery.
- Issues such as same sex marriage, climate change, euthanasia.
- Church and State in the Republic of Ireland, with reference to one example, e.g. Mother and Child Scheme, repeal of the 8th Amendment.
- The role of Dutch Reform Church in supporting Apartheid in S Africa.
- The role of the Lords Spiritual with reference to one example.
- Christians in Nazi Germany, e.g. Niemöller, Bonhoeffer.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must support their answer with reference to at least one other unit of study to access Bands 4–5

(AO1)

[20]

(b) “Religion causes more controversy and conflict than it resolves.”
 Critically assess this claim. You must refer to other aspects of human experience in your answer.

Answers may include:

- Examples of conflict and/or controversy.
- Judeo-Christian principles reflected in the Law, e.g. 10 commandments.
- Teaching of Jesus in the Sermon on the Mount.
- Religion as a source of controversy and conflict in multi faith societies.
- Just War Theory.
- Religion as a source of conflict, e.g. Holy Wars, religious based terrorism.
- Disputes between Shi’a and Sunni Muslims.
- The role of religion in conflict in India between Hindus and Muslims.
- The role played by religion in conflict in the former Yugoslavia.
- Religious views on controversial issues, e.g. same sex marriage, abortion; Sharia Law and arranged marriage, as a cause of division in communities.
- Religious controversy as the cause of schism, e.g. between Rome and Constantinople, the doctrine of transubstantiation.
- Pacifism: e.g. The Quakers, Gandhi.
- The contribution of religious figures in conflict resolution, e.g. Alec Reid, Martin Luther King, these interventions themselves as controversial and dividing the community.
- The Ecumenical Movement.
- Work of faith-based peace groups, e.g. Corrymeela.
- Religious arguments about nuclear arms and weapons of mass destruction.
- State policies as sources of conflict and division in the community, e.g. government favouritism of one religious group such as Buddhism in Laos.
- Religion as inflexible and intolerant as expressed in the views of Richard Dawkins.
- The South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission and its religious underpinnings.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5

(AO2)

[30]

Section B

Total

**AVAILABLE
MARKS**

50

50

150